

THE PADDINGTON SOCIETY INC

FOR COMMUNITY AND HERITAGE

Tim Wise Manager State Planning Projects City of Sydney

1 July 2025 / LG

Re: Feedback on Proposed Planning Changes to Heritage Conservation Areas

The Paddington Society welcomes the opportunity to comment on these planned changes as they affect Paddington.

1. LEP 2012 Conservation Areas Review

The transfer of properties (Town Hall and Ambulance Station) from the Barracks C49 HCA to South Paddington C 48 HCA makes sense, as we agree that these properties relate more to the residential precinct than the military one.

We request that the Field Survey mentioned on p.10 of the Review be publicly available, as it is a valuable resource now and in the future for Heritage Impact Statements.

We also request that Council take this opportunity to review adding Heritage Items to the LEP, especially for some intact rows and for other significant buildings – please refer to our study of South Paddington and sent to Council on 20/7/2021, attached again. Heritage Item additions would help safeguard our world-class heritage area, at a time when some recent State Government policies have the potential to endanger it.

2. DCP 2012 Amendments Conservation Areas Review Section 3.9

We welcome the inclusion of objectives in this Section, as well as additional detail for such controls as Demolition. We recommend the following re specific DCP Controls

3.9.7 (14) Photo-voltaic panels: We note that PVs can be located on the principal roof plane in HCAs. To have these panels as unobtrusive as possible, we recommend that they are close in colour to the roofing (with no silver banding), and that they have a matt surface.

Party walls: work affecting party walls is not covered – a statement on the legal position (eg may need neighbour consent) and a recommended process would save a lot of neighbour heartache. A recommendation re painting external street portions of party walls would also be welcome (e.g. not half-and half for the nib!)

For more detailed recommendations on DCP controls, I have attached our September 2021 letter to Council which is still relevant to both Parts 3 and 4 of the current DCP,

Yours faithfully

Esther Hayter, President The Paddington Society

Extertager

Per Linda Gosling, Vice President, Mobile: 0406 614217



THE PADDINGTON SOCIETY Inc. For Community and Heritage Est 1964

20 July 2021

Attention: City of Sydney Council Tim Wise, Manager Planning Policy

Dear Mr. Wise,

City of Sydney Review of DCP Heritage Controls South Paddington Conservation Area Intact Rows

Thank you for allowing The Paddington Society to input into your Heritage review.

The built environment in Paddington evolved mostly in the 1870s to 1890s with the construction of 2, 3 or more terraces by the one developer, which has resulted in a delightful consistency of form and detail for the row, with subtle differences to other rows. Over the years we have seen a degradation of the heritage value of rows of terraces, e.g. through detracting balconies and front fences, and we have seen the introduction of inappropriate front dormers, rear roof extensions and upper rear additions, which threaten the consistency and establish unfortunate precedents for the rest of the row.

To safeguard Paddington's heritage we encourage owners and Council assessment staff to consider the value of the group or row as well as the individual terrace.

To this end, we have prepared an analysis of the area which identifies intact, or almost intact, terrace rows, along with recommendations to enhance the row by reinstating significant building elements.

We hope that the study will ensure development of these terraces which is sympathetic to the row and which will reverse detracting elements.

The principle of reinstatement in almost intact rows is already endorsed in Sydney DCP 2012 Clause 3.9.7 Contributory Buildings (see attached).

In the course of our analysis, we have also identified some 18 individual buildings which we consider merit special Heritage Item status, and which are not already listed. These fall into categories of early artisan buildings, grand/unusual single terraces, corner shops, cottages, and a few modern infill/additions of worthy architectural merit.

We have also identified 2 properties which we recommend be upgraded from Neutral to Contributory status in the DCP Building Contributions Map (see Recommendation column in Attachment 2).

Please do not hesitate to contact the under-signed for more information or to arrange a site visit,

Yours faithfully

Will Mrongovius,

W g

President, The Paddington Society

Ph: 0407 418 780 email: wmrongovius@gmail.com

Attachment 1

Clause 3.9.7 Contributory Items (emphasis added)

Contributory buildings are buildings that make an important and significant contribution to the character and significance of the heritage conservation area. They have a reasonable to high degree of integrity and date from a key development period of significance of the heritage conservation area. They are buildings:

- from a significant historical period and are highly or substantially intact; or
- from a significant historical period and are altered yet recognisable and reversible.
- (1) Contributory buildings are to be retained unless the consent authority determines the replacement is justified in exceptional circumstances.
- (2) Alterations and additions must not significantly alter the appearance of principal and significant facades of a contributory building, except to remove detracting elements.
- (3) Alterations and additions to a contributory building are to:
 - (a) respect significant original or characteristic built form;
 - (b) respect significant traditional or characteristic subdivision patterns;
 - (c) retain significant fabric;
 - (d) retain, and where possible reinstate, significant features and building elements, including but not limited to original balconies and verandahs, fences, chimneys, joinery and shop front detailing;
 - (e) remove unsympathetic alterations and additions, including inappropriate building elements;
 - (f) use appropriate materials, finishes and colours; and
 - (g) respect the pattern, style and dimensions of original windows and doors.
- (4) Where an addition to the building is proposed, significant external elements are to be reinstated.
- (5) Foyers or other significant interior features, including hallway detailing, panelling and significant staircases, designed to be visible from the street, are to be retained especially where they form part of the building's contribution to the character of the heritage conservation area.

Attachment 2 Heritage Recommendations (sent separately)

Attachment 3: Building Contributions Map showing Intact Rows (sent separately)

<u>Attachment 4</u>: Heritage Recommendations Photos (sent separately)

ATTACHMENT 2 HERITAGE RECOMMENDATIONS to CITY OF SYDNEY COUNCIL for SOUTH PADDINGTON From THE PADDINGTON SOCIETY for Additional Heritage Items, & Intact Terrace Rows July 2021

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	COMMENT	RECOMMENDATION
Albion Ave	1	\bigcirc		Single storey early brick cottage	
	35 -47		\otimes	Row of 7 grand three level parapeted Victorian terraces, two up, one down. Generally intact external fenestration, door and lace details. Rear partly visible with 47intact. No 35 rear not intact.	Allow no front dormers. Remove entry & verandah tiling no. 37 & security cage no 47. Maintain intact rear no 47.
Alexander St (odd nos. are rear of Oatley)	6-8		\otimes	Largely intact pair of narrow terraces, matching parapets, lace, fences	No 6 to re-instate render to top floor
	14A-28		\otimes	Largely intact row of 8: 18 enclosed balcony, 28 modern stripped; all other retain original lace	Open balcony of 18. No 28 to match lace
	27-29	\otimes		Corner shop (not still trading) and attached terrace with parapet with intact windows and doors. No 27 rear not intact, modern addition visible from Stewart St	Good example of humble corner shop & terrace. Retain all façade elements particularly no. 27 corner shop.
Bent St	33-37	Already listed	Ø	'Glammis' 3 storey corner terrace, incl interior, plus terrace pair incl interior Item I11046 & I1047	
Church Place (off Ulster)	7-9	Already listed		2 attached timber cottages, incl interiors Item I1048	Replace high brick wall to Church Place with low front picket fence
Church Street (off Selwyn)	2	\otimes		brick warehouse converted to single residence, unusual in the area	
	3-15		\otimes	Row of 7 gable-roof terraces, streetscape intact, no 7 has rear roof extension	Allow no front dormers or more rear roof extensions
	22-26		\otimes	Trio of 3 modest gable terraces with cantilevered balconies, rear not visible	Allow no front dormers
Flinders St	126- 146,	Already listed	\odot	Grand Terraces, Single & groups, incl interiors & front fences, Items I1050 – I1057,	Remove front addition no 126, unenclose balconies no 128, 132, 136 & 140

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	COMMENT	RECOMMENDATION
	150- 156,			I1058 – I1059	Reinstate render no 136
Gordon St	1-3		⊘	Concertina pair Victorian terraces intact except for raised rear roof no 3	No front dormers allowed
	5-7	Already listed		Commercial building incl interior Item I1061	Now residential, & no. 7 Replace high brick wall to west side of entry door to Gordon St with iron fence to match. Encourage more sympathetic colour scheme.
	29-35		\otimes	Victorian row of 4, gabled slate roofs, no 29 side visible, original balcony lace except no. 33, render removed no. 33	No front dormers allowed, no rear roof extension no. 29, no. 33 to match lace & replace render
	43-47		\otimes	Trio of classic terraces Including unusual corner hipped terrace, slate roofs, matching lace, fences? Front & rears intact, rears visible Georges Lane	No front dormers allowed & only rear dormers Retain rhythm of rear skillions Replace upper rear window no. 43 to traditional proportions
	51-53		\otimes	Unusual hipped roof concertina pair on corner No. 51 Fronts & side intact except for balcony & visible from Leinster St	No front dormers allowed Retain side & rear form no. 51 – only allow rear dormer
	68-70		\otimes	Double-fronted mid-Victorian duo Recently restored to single house	
	72-78		\bigcirc	Front & rears largely intact, Rears visible from Ulster St	No front dormers allowed Retain rhythm of rear skillions Remove rear decks
	86-88		\odot	Imposing pair 3 storeys, incl chimneys & possible front stables entry no 88 Rears visible from St Matthias & largely intact except no. 88 upper windows	Remove paint from sandstone front fence No. 88 to replace rear windows
Greens Rd	39-45		0	Row of 4 classic Victorian terraces with front parapets, rear no 39 visible & intact	Remove ground floor verandah tiling no 39 & 45, retain rear no 39
	49-85		\bigcirc	Bartlett's Terrace 1884 19 parapeted terraces with cantilevered balconies, intact except enclosed balconies & front doors	No 51, 53, 55, 83 & 85 to unenclose balconies. Replace inappropriate doors 59, 63, 83 Remove brick facing to façade no. 51.
	87-89		\odot	Pair of gable-roof terraces Fairly intact	No front dormers allowed

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	COMMENT	RECOMMENDATION
					Remove enclosed balcony & ground floor tiling no 89
	91-97		\otimes	Intact row of 4 gable roof terraces except no 97 window	No front dormers allowed Replace no 97 window & reinstate plaster head to match others
	99	\otimes		Small single storey timber cottage	
	103- 109		\otimes	Intact row except for 109 where Council taking action to reinstate front windows	No front dormers allowed
Iris St	1-49		⊘	'Cannon Terrace 1884', long row of 25 modest terraces with cantilevered balconies, stepped in pairs, fairly intact except for some balconies, balustrades & front windows Originally under single owner	Unenclose balcony to no 7, 17, 33, & 35. remove balustrade & match lace on 1, 21, 25, 27, 29, 31. change windows to 23, 37, 39, 49. Replace render no 35.
Josephson St	13-19		0	Row of 4 modest gable terraces, intact except dormer no 13	No more front dormers allowed
Leinster St	46-52		⊘	Row of 4 Victorian terraces with front parapets, no 46 side visible Intact fencing with stone base	Retain fencing incl no painting of stone
	119- 121		\otimes	Pair almost intact Victorian gable terraces with basement, sides visible	No front dormers allowed, & only rear dormers. Remove non-traditional side window to gable no. 119
	63-69		\bigcirc	Modest row of 4 gable terraces, no 63 side visible, lace pattern intact	No front dormers allowed, & only rear dormer no. 63
	71-79		\otimes	Modest row of 5 gable terraces Intact except for 1 front dormer, & balustrade lace pattern no. 73 & 79	No more front dormers allowed, replace lace on 73 & 79 to match
Little Napier St	1-17 & 2-14	Already listed	\otimes	Modest terrace rows precinct, incl interiors Items I1064 & I1065	
Little Selwyn St	9	\otimes		Single storey timber cottage, a good example of cottages in this precinct	
Martin Street	9-17		0	Matching row of 5 modest terraces, cantilevered balconies overhanging	Allow no front dormers. Match lace to no. 11. Open balcony no. 17

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	COMMENT	RECOMMENDATION
				footpath; different laces, no. 17 balcony enclosed	
Moore Park Road West of Barracks	4 - 30	Already listed	⊘	Grand Terraces, Single & pair, incl interiors & front fences, rears visible Josephon St Items I1066 – I1076,	Unenclose balconies to no 20, 22, 26 Rear roof extensions no 16 & 18 are detracting – should match no 14 Rear buildings over garages also detracting.
Moore Park Road East of Barracks	234- 236		\oslash	Largely intact terrace pair, gable roof behind parapet, matching lace and details, intact 2-storey rear extension	Preserve intact elements
	238	\oslash		Intact single house 'Dartrey', 2 storeys, orig. stained glass, front tiles; but modern lace	Good example of free- standing late Victorian decorated terrace Research original lace & replace.
	246-50		\otimes	Largely intact imposing trio of 3 storey terraces with raised entry, currently 'UKO Co- Living'	Allow no front dormers Remove glass balustrade no 248 & 250. Remove commercial signage
	252- 252A		\otimes	Intact terrace pair, 2 storeys, old lace, fence, floor tiles, windows, doors with stained glass	Allow no front dormers No 252A replace modern upper French doors
	254- 272		\otimes	Intact row of 10 imposing terraces, 3 storeys, intact 2-storey rear extension with opposed skillions	Allow no front dormers No. 262 to match lace No. 270 remove tiles to stone steps
	276- 278		\otimes	Almost matching imposing terrace pair 3 storeys, 278 has modern lace and 276 has front brick wall	No 276 to match fence & no 278 to match lace
	280	\otimes		Large semi-detached house 'Olympia' with entry tower feature, original lace and details, highly decorated façade; vestiges of stable at rear	Good example of free- standing late Victorian decorated terrace with emphasised entry. Preserve vestiges of stable. Replace black & white modern tiles to front entry path.
	292- 296		\otimes	Largely intact terrace trio, 3 storeys, same decoration (296 altered with dormer)	No 296 to match lace No 292 to remove quarry tiles to front paving & replace top floor windows with double-hung
	298- 302		\odot	Imposing terrace trio, 3 storeys, non-matching lace on balconies but all 3 same below, original window	Good example of imposing 3 storey decorated late Victorian terraces.

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	COMMENT	RECOMMENDATION
				decorations; 302 has 2 front dormers, Intact 2 storey gable rears visible from Regent St	Allow no more front dormers No 298 to match lace & remove tiles from ground verandah paving
	326- 330		\otimes	Trio of Victorian terraces, fronts intact, original round- headed dormer to no. 326?, rears not visible	Replace windows & barges to no 328-330 dormers to match no. 326 Remove paint to fencing stone base
	338- 346		\otimes	Row of 5 decorated Victorian parapet terraces with end feature terrace, intact except for no 342 front car space & balustrade lace	Replace front fence & gate to no. 342 to match row Replace lace to 340-344 to match 338
	348- 350		\otimes	Unusual pair of raised decorative Victorian terraces, side entry, intact lace Stone front fence base	
	372- 376		\otimes	Imposing trio of terraces with Ionic columns on ground floor & faceted dormers, largely intact rears & visible Leinster St	Allow only rear roof dormers Remove HW tank on rear roof plane no. 372
	378- 382		\otimes	Unusual trio of 2 storey face brick Federation terraces intact incl fences	
	398- 402		\otimes	Imposing trio of 3 storey terraces with largely intact rears	
	404- 408	Already listed	\otimes	Face brick Federation terrace group incl interiors & front fencing Item I1080	
	414- 436		\otimes	Long row of 11 Victorian gable terraces plus end double-fronted terrace at corner, largely intact except for painted stone fencing base, 3 glass enclosed balconies, no, 434 mismatched lace pattern, rhythm of upper rear skillions visible Gordon St.	Remove paint from stonework Remove glass enclosed balconies No. 434 to replace lace with matching pattern Encourage similar roofing (dark metal or slate) Retain rear skillions.
Napier Street	3	\otimes		Grand three storey Victorian end Terrace, side visible, exterior intact	Allow only rear roof dormers Render brick side fence
	5-17		\odot	Row of intact modest Victorian terraces, including roof and dormers.	No additional dormers to roof.
	8-12		\otimes	Trio of Victorian parapeted terraces, intact with exception of no. 12 with enclosed	Unenclose balcony & match fence no. 12

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	COMMENT	RECOMMENDATION
				balcony & brick fence, rears visible & generally intact	
	14-16 & 18		\otimes	Pair of Victorian parapeted terraces plus infill terrace, intact, rears visible & generally intact	
	20-24		$ \otimes $	Trio of Victorian parapeted terraces, intact with exception of no. 20 brick fence & 22 with removed render, rears visible & generally intact	Reinstate front fence no 20, & render to no. 22
	25-31	Already listed	\bigcirc	Modest terrace row of 4 with cantilevered balconies, incl interiors Item I1081	
	26-46			Long Row of 11 Victorian parapeted terraces, with possible end corner shop. Front exteriors generally intact with the exception no. 36 with enclosed balcony and brick fence. Rears visible & generally intact.	Unenclose balcony & remove brick fence no 36. Retain joinery corner shop no. 46
Oatlan	15 27			Imposing set of 7.2 stores	Cood avamala of imposing
Oatley Road	15-27		\otimes	Imposing set of 7 3-storey terraces. Largely intact, matching lace; matching opposed skillions visible at rear. No 27 on corner has visible sympathetic modern rear addition	Good example of imposing 3-storey terrace row. Allow no front dormers or changes to front fences or rear skillions. Encourage slate or dark metal roof.
Regent St East side	2-4	Already listed	\oslash	2 terraces incl shop	Now 1 residence
	6-20	Already listed	\otimes	3 concertina terrace groups incl interiors & front fencing Items I1098-I1100	Remove front brick fence to no. 6 & no. 8
	62-68		\otimes	6 Victorian gable terraces fronts intact incl stone fencing, except for dormer & metal roof to No. 66 Rears not intact	No more front dormers allowed Replace no 66 roof with slate
	70-74		\odot	Trio of 2-storey Victorian terraces with stone fencing base, rears intact & visible Stewart St	No front dormers allowed, only rear dormers, retail skillion rears
	86-90		\odot	Trio of 3 storey Victorian terraces incl stone fencing base intact except for no. 88 front render removed & paint to stone	Replace render to no. 88, remove paint to stone, no front dormers allowed only rear dormers, retain skillion forms

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	COMMENT	RECOMMENDATION
				Rears intact visible from Leinster St	
Regent Street odd (west side)	9	\otimes		Corner shop and 2-storey residence with parapet & wrap-around balcony, original details	Good example of Victorian corner shop and residence.
	19-21		\otimes	Pair of imposing terraces, partly intact	Allow no front dormers. No 19 to match lace, no. 21 to remove paving tiles to stone
	23	\otimes		Unusual Victorian Gothic 2- storey infill	Victorian Gothic free standing house not common in area
	31-35		\otimes	Intact 2-storey terrace trio, original & matching lace. 33 (run down) and 35 have original veranda floor tiles; 31 and 35 have non-standard front dormers	Restore no 33, replace tiles no 31.
	43-53		⊘	Partly intact imposing 3-storey terrace row of 5. 45 and 47 have enclosed balconies. No original lace. Variety of access stairs to lower floor. Lower windows and doors original and intact	Allow no front dormers Open balconies of 45 and 47 at next opportunity 45 lower stairs to match others
	59-63			Partly intact trio of unusual staggered Federation terraces, hipped end roofs, stained glass fanlights. Original tile floors on front verandas. 59 has modern lace. No. 63 corner terrace is 3 storeys, non-aligned rear extension with roof deck. 59, 61 both 2 storeys, matching rear extensions with breezeway between.	No 59 match lace & front door to others. No 61 replace concrete tiles with slate roof
Renny St odd (south side)	1-11, & 35A Alexan der		\otimes	Largely intact row of 5 modest terraces plus corner parapet terraces at each end. Matching doors & windows; only 5, 7, 9 retain original lace, 5 has replaced front fence with wall; rear setbacks align	No front dormers allowed. No. 3 and 11 to match lace. No. 5 to match fence
	15	⊘		Bakery on this site was one of earliest buildings in South Paddington (c. 1850-1860?) - vestiges remain, e.g. large wooden door on side for flour deliveries	List as heritage item due to age and use. Re-instate render to Renny St facade
	31	\bigcirc		Single storey cottage with 2 storey modern extension by architect Kim Crestani	21 st century heritage list as good example of heritage infill

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	COMMENT	RECOMMENDATION
Renny St even (north side)	12-26		⊘	Row of 6 terraces with stone entry steps, plus corner building with parapet, former shopfront, no front veranda; 14, 16, 18, 24 & 26 share same lace; all have lion's head motif on pilasters; rears diverse and not intact, 2 front dormers. Original single owner.	Still chance to control further changes at rear. Allow no more front dormers. Remove tiles to front stone steps no. 22 & 24.
	44	\otimes		Corner shop still operating with flats above and behind, shop windows intact	Good example of humble corner shop. Social significance too as bootmakers for many years (previously butcher).
	46-54		\otimes	Partly intact row at front; initials "SG" (Samuel Gordon?) incorp. in all front pilaster mouldings; 46 has wall replacing iron fence; rears aligned but not intact	Preserve SG initials
	58	\otimes		Elevated C19 single storey double-fronted bungalow with modern additions at rear by architect Rick Leplastrier	20th century heritage list as good example of Leplastrier which respects cottage heritage
Rose Terrace	1-17 & 2-20	Already listed	\otimes	Modest row of terraces in a precinct, incl interiors Items I1102 & I1103	
Selwyn St	1-9	Already listed	⊘	Modest row of gable terraces, cantilevered balcony Item I1104	Allow no front dormers Reinstate render? No 3 balcony balustrade to match others.
	20-48		$ \oslash $	'Maryson Terrace' Long modest row of 14 parapeted terraces, stepped in pairs, intact except some stripped of render	Reinstate render no 28, 38, 46. No 42 to match lace of others. Replace brick fence with iron no 36.
	21-23		\otimes	Distinctive pair parapeted & gable Victorian terraces, recessed entries, cantilevered balconies, sides visible	Retain intact sides Change from neutral to contributory in DCP map
	27-39		\otimes	Matching row of 7 classic gable terraces, intact incl lace pattern & front fences Rears visible but not intact	Allow no front dormers Reinstate iron fence no 39, & replace inappropriate door no 35
	50	\otimes		'Selwyn House' Double fronted Victorian parapeted terrace, rear not visible	
	Rear of 52	\otimes		Former dairy On Iris St frontage	

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	COMMENT	RECOMMENDATION
Seymour Place	2-6		⊘	Trio of modest gable terraces set back from street Rears not visible	Allow no front dormers
South Dowling Street	260- 282	Already listed	\odot	Part of Rose Terrace precinct Items I1105, I1106, I1107	Reinstate render no 276, remove detracting side windows & rear additions
	288- 290		\otimes	Pair of terraces, with cantilevered balconies & parapet, one possibly initially commercial, central entry, intact lace, to front facade	Research retail & DA history for origin
	368- 378	Already listed		Grand terrace rows, incl interiors Items I1109, I1110,	
Stewart St	17-29		Ø	Intact 2-storey row of 7 modest terraces orig. lace and rounded front door & window shapes. No front dormers	Allow no front dormers Remove exposed aggregate topping to front ground verandahs nos. 21, 23
	22, 24, 26		\odot	3 detached modest weatherboard cottages, double-fronted; and angled to street, no. 26 derelict	Preserve and restore 26 Match front fences – suggest timber picket
	35-47		\otimes	Largely intact 2-storey terrace row of 7, same lace, rounded windows & doors. 39, 41 have front dormers, 35 & 37 not intact	Allow no more front dormers No 35 & 37 to match lace, front fence, ground floor window
	59-65, and 65A		\otimes	Largely intact 2-storey row of 5 modest terraces with decorated parapet; same lace, original round-headed doors and windows	No 63 to match fence & ground floor window
	36-38		\otimes	Pair of classic, highly decorated terraces incl corner terrace with side upper verandah & stone fencing base & intact rear skillion form to no. 36	Retain side verandah & rear skillion form & window to no. 36
	50	\odot		Contemporary 1995 version of traditional terrace by architect Ken Woolley, his last home. Significant interiors also.	20 th century heritage list Change from neutral to contributory in DCP map
	52-58	Already listed	\bigcirc	Terrace group incl interiors & front fencing, Rears intact Item I1112	
	73-79		\otimes	Slate-roofed row of 4 intact at front except for ground floor plaster frieze to no 79	Re-instate plaster frieze & side verandah lace to no. 79

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	COMMENT	RECOMMENDATION
				No. 79 side upper verandah form intact except for balustrade	
	87-87 1/2		\bigcirc	Pair of raised Victorian parapet terraces with shared stair tower, sides visible	
	91-3	\otimes		Imposing double-fronted house Victorian Gothic style 2 storey	Encourage slate or dark metal roof
Stewart Place	7-9	\odot		2 stone, slate roofed attached cottages with dormers	Associated with Gordon's Mill Encourage low front fence
Walter Street	3-7		\bigcirc	Modest trio of terraces with cantilevered balconies, intact except for different lace	Match lace to no. 5
	15A- 21		\bigcirc	No. 11 wider with parapet; 15a-21 intact row of 5 terraces, orig lace, fences, doors and windows	11 may be first built. Intact row Allow no front dormers or fence changes
	26-34		⊘	Matching row of 5 modest terraces but 26 non- matching lace, 30 front dormer, 32 timber balustrade and 34 a brick front wall	Allow no more front dormers No 26 to match lace No 32 to match lace & no. 34 to match front fence
	33-37		⊘	Trio of narrow terraces with parapet including corner terrace, intact except for window & door no. 33	No. 33 to match window & door
Watson St	5-13		\otimes	2 modest rows with overhanging balconies Original lace to upper balconies. Fronts intact except for 1 dormer	No more front dormers allowed



ATTACHMENT 4 PHOTOS HERITAGE RECOMMENDATIONS to CITY OF SYDNEY COUNCIL for SOUTH PADDINGTON From THE PADDINGTON SOCIETY for Additional Heritage Items, & Intact Terrace Rows July 2021

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
Albion Ave	1	⊘		
	35 -47		\otimes	
Alexander St (odd nos. are rear of Oatley)	6-8		⊗	
	14A-28		⊗	
	27-29	⊗		

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
Bent St	33-37	Already listed		
Church Place (off Ulster)	7-9	Already listed	⊘	
Church Street (off Selwyn)	2	\otimes		
	3-15		\otimes	
	22-26		⊗	

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
Flinders St	126-146, 150-156,	Already listed	\otimes	
Gordon St	1-3		\otimes	
	5-7	Already listed		
	29-35		⊗	
	43-47		\otimes	

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
	51-53		\otimes	
	68-70		\otimes	
	72-78		\otimes	
	86-88		⊗	
Greens Rd	39-45		\otimes	

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
	49-85		\otimes	
	87-89		\otimes	
	91-97		⊗	
	99	\otimes		
	103-109		\otimes	

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
Iris St	1-49		\otimes	
Josephson St	13-19		\otimes	
Leinster St	46-52		\otimes	
	119-121		\otimes	
	63-69		\otimes	
	71-79		⊗	

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
Little Napier St	1-17 & 2- 14	Already listed	\otimes	
Little Selwyn St	9	\otimes		
Martin Street	9-17		\otimes	
Moore Park Road West of Barracks	4 - 30	Already listed	\otimes	
Moore Park Road East of Barracks	234-236		⊗	

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
	238			
	246-50		\otimes	
	252-252A		\otimes	
	254-272			

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
	276-278		\otimes	276
	280	\otimes		
	292-296		⊗	
	298-302		⊗	

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
	326-330		\otimes	
	338-346		\otimes	
	348-350		\otimes	
	372-376		\otimes	
	378-382		\otimes	

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
	398-402		\otimes	
	404-408	Already listed	\otimes	
	414-436		\otimes	
Napier Street	3	⊗		
	5-17		\otimes	

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
	8-12		\otimes	
	14-16 & 18		\otimes	See above
	20-24		\otimes	See above
	25-31	Already listed	\otimes	
	26-46		\bigcirc	see 8-12 above
Oatley Road	15-27		⊗	
Regent St East Side	2-4	Already listed		
	6-20	Already listed		

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
	62-68		⊘	
	70-74		⊗	
	86-90		\otimes	
Regent Street odd (west side)	9	⊗		
	19-21		⊗	

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
	23	\otimes		
	31-35		\otimes	
	43-53		⊗	
	59-63		⊘	
Renny St odd (south side)	1-11, & 35A Alexander		⊗	

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
	15	\otimes		
	31	\otimes		
Renny St even (north side)	12-26		\otimes	
	44	\otimes		
	46-54		\otimes	

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
	58	\otimes		
Rose Terrace	1-17 & 2- 20	Already listed	\otimes	
Selwyn St	1-9	Already listed	⊗	
	20-48		⊘	
	21-23		⊗	
	27-39		⊗	39

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
	50	\otimes		
	Rear of 52	\otimes		
Seymour Place	2-6		\otimes	
South Dowling St	260-282	Already listed		
	288-290		⊗	

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
	368-378	Already		
Stewart St	17-29		(
	22, 24, 26		\otimes	
	35-47		⊘	
	59-65, and 65A		Ø	

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
	36-38		⊘	
	50	\otimes		
	52-58	Already listed	⊗	
	73-79		⊗	
	87-87 1/2		⊗	
	91-3	⊘		19

STREET	No.	HERIT ITEM	INTACT ROW	РНОТО
Stewart Place	7-9		\otimes	
Walter Street	3-7		⊘	
	15A-21		⊗	
	26-34		⊘	
	33-37		⊗	
Watson St	5-13		⊘	



THE PADDINGTON SOCIETY Inc. For Community and Heritage Est 1964

15 September 2021

Attention: City of Sydney Council Tim Wise, Manager Planning Policy Copy Jesse McNicoll, Claudine Loffi, Ben Pechey, Pauline Lockie

Dear Tim,

City of Sydney Review of DCP Heritage Controls South Paddington Conservation Area

We understand that City of Sydney Council is reviewing the Sydney DCP 2012 controls.

As a community organisation that seeks to protect and enhance the built heritage of Paddington, we offer the following observations, arising from a decade of assessing DA submissions via the DCP, and analysing the built outcomes.

The controls outlined in the DCP affecting Heritage Conservation Areas have been designed to protect South Paddington Conservation Area. We have formed the view as a result of our analysis that the success of the controls has been mixed. Of greatest concern is the application of discretion and subjective judgement in the assessment of Development Applications to such an extent that the integrity of the controls has been eroded.

We also believe that the controls need to be improved and updated to reflect latest best practice. We outline our observed deficiencies and recommendations for improvement in our submission below.

1 DCP CONTROLS ROUTINELY NOT IMPLEMENTED

<u>Clause 3.9.7(3) (4) re Contributory Buildings - Re-instatement of significant external elements.</u> (see also Section 2 below)

Even in largely intact rows, Council rarely requires the reinstatement of significant external elements, even in largely intact rows, and even when the re-instatement would be small and form a minimal cost when compared to the cost of works proposed.

We appreciate that this may be onerous for a low-value DA, but consider that the clause could be rewritten as in Section 2 below with a \$value trigger point, which would include any Complying Certificate work associated with a DA.

Refer toDA D/2017/1655/A for 18 Bent St, DA 2020/1305 for 20 Bent St (both with detracting brick front fences), and our submission on DA 48 Selwyn St (with missing fence spear points) also D/2016/1739 for 101 Greens Rd (detracting front window) and D/2019/1346 60 Gordon St (missing below-verandah lace and dentils, inappropriate door).

<u>Clause 4.1.1 Building Height (1) Development is not to exceed the maximum storeys on the Building Height in Storeys Map, also Clause 4.1.4.6 Additional Storeys</u>

This height has been exceeded and storeys added in some instances, resulting in bulk and solar impacts to streetscapes and neighbours.

Refer to DA D/2016/726 for 58 Renny St, and DA D/2021/181 48 Selwyn St.

Clause 4.1.3.1 Solar Access

Council assessment of development often discounts neighbours' challenges, including alternative sun studies to those studies submitted by applicants in DAs. 2 hours minimum sun to living rooms and private open spaces of neighbours, a minimal control in itself compared to other inner city controls for solar access, is often not achieved.

Council should require applicants to use an approved program/s and provide co-ordinates for their shadow diagrams. So that Council staff can more readily check the diagrams submitted. Council staff should be trained to do a 'reality check' to identify incorrect shadow diagrams submitted.

Refer to DA D/2018/98 for 3 Regent St, DA D/2016/726 for 58 Renny St, and D/2013/1981 for 39 Selwyn St.

Clause 4.1.4.1 (3) Additions and alterations

Council routinely approves additions that extend beyond the predominant rear alignment particularly at ground level. Such ground floor additions can severely impact on a neighbour's solar and daylight access and should not be allowed unless it can be demonstrated that there are no such impacts.

Refer to D/2017/870 for 7 Regent St and DA D/2018/98 for 3 Regent St.

Clause 4.1.5.4 (2) Traditional Front Dormers

(see also Section 2 below)

Council routinely approves new front dormers where there is no established pattern in the row, and dormers that don't meet the detail controls. This establishes a precedent for the rest of the row.

Refer to DA D/2020/973 for 27 Walter St, DA 2020/1328 for 71 Stewart Street, DA D/2021/762 for 97 Stewart St (pending), and DA D/2019/1346 for 60 Gordon St.

Clause 4.1.5.5 (1) (c), (7) and (8) Rear Roof Extensions

(see also Section 2 below)

Council also often approves these additions where there is no established pattern or where they are highly visible from a public place, and often does not enforce traditional windows, or opaque glazing to 1.4m above the floor, resulting in privacy problems for neighbours.

Refer to D/2016/778 for 5 Short St, D/2018/127 for 7 Church St, D/2021/886 (pending) for 9 Selwyn St (no established pattern), DA D/2017/833 for 37 Selwyn St (glass louvres approved and no obscure glass required), DA D/2016/1815 for 49 Albion St (no established pattern), and D/2021/50 for 27A Oatley Road (visible from Alexander St).

Clause 4.1.8.1 (1) Balconies, verandahs & decks

Many terraces in the area have rear decks or balconies that overlook neighbours., whether at first floor or attic level. A frequent response from Council staff to overlooking issues raised is that this is to be expected in inner city residential areas, but this adverse impact on amenity should not be allowed. Juliet balconies which do not protrude are acceptable.

Recommendation: that the above DCP controls are enforced as the default position.

2 DCP CONTROLS THAT NEED TO BE REVISED

The following are recommended changes to controls that would clarify and/or strengthen implementation.

<u>Clause 3.9.7(3)(4)</u> <u>Contributory Buildings</u> – include a \$ trigger point and max spend proportional to the total DA spend:

Where substantial alterations and additions are proposed to the value of \$100,000 or more to any part of a contributory building, the reinstatement of significant external elements, to the street frontage are to be reinstated on buildings identified as intact Map xx, up to a value of 10% of the DA estimate.

<u>Clause 4.1.3.2 Solar collectors.</u> Protection of solar access to roofs for solar panels only applies to existing panels but should apply to potential locations on all roofs, to encourage the uptake of solar panels and to protect solar rights.

Add the underlined:

- (2) Where possible, proposals for new buildings, alterations and additions to buildings or major tree plantings are to maintain solar access to existing <u>and potential</u> photovoltaic solar panels having regard to performance, efficiency, economic viability and reasonableness of their location. A development proposal may be modified to protect solar access to existing <u>or potential</u> solar collectors.

<u>Clause 4.1.3.4 Deep Soil Planting</u> Extend to all sites, to increase greening of the precinct and to reduce stormwater run-off. Many terraces in South Paddington are below the current 150m2 lot size cut-off.

Add/amend:

- (1) For lots up to 150m2, the minimum amount of deep soil in the private open space is 6m2, preferably in a location to allow the planting of a small tree.

<u>Clause 4.1.5.4 (2) Traditional Front Dormers</u> Many front dormers are ill proportioned, often too dominant and poorly detailed. This control needs to be tightened to achieve the intended result of a minor element in the roofscape which reflects traditional detailing (include the details in the controls and don't rely on notes in DCP Figure 4.14).

Refer to D/2018/572/A 6 Walter St (dormer too high and vertical).

An analysis of South Paddington dormers and a comparative study of dormer controls in the Leichhardt, Waverley and Woollahra DCPs has been undertaken, and forms the basis of the following suggested changes:

Add/amend:

- *Restrict height to max 1.5 x width, measured from head to sill of the window frame* (note than 2 x width is not a traditional proportion)
- Pitch of dormer roof to be between 30 & 45 degrees
- Top of dormer to be min 300mm below main roof ridge
- Roof sheeting and barge board must not exceed 150mm overhang in front of window, and rafters are to project max 100mm beyond width of dormer
- Dormers must not include a gutter or downpipe
- No balconies or Juliet balconies
- No wall cladding below the sill

Clause 4.1.5.5 (1) (c), (7) and (8) Rear Roof Extensions:

Many rear roof extensions are too bulky so that they appear as an additional storey rather than a discreet roof feature. The Paddington Society prefers the use of rear traditional dormers since this was a Victorian era roof feature, since so many rears are visible from the public domain, since there are many streets where terraces face the rears of opposite terraces, and since these roof extensions often impact poorly on surrounding neighbours.

An analysis of South Paddington rear roof extensions and a comparative study of rear roof extension controls in the Leichhardt, Waverley and Woollahra DCPs has been undertaken and forms the basis of the following suggested changes:

Add/amend:

- Set back a min of 900mm from side walls as measured from the inner edge of the building's side or party walls
- Set back a min of 500mm from the rear wall as measured along the roof plane
- Set back a min of 300mm below main roof ridge
- Max window height of 1.8m
- Min slope of skillion roof is 5 degrees and metal roofing to be corrugated profile
- Roof sheeting and gutter must not exceed 150mm overhang in front of window
- No balconies or Juliet balconies
- No wall cladding below the sill

Clause 4.1.6.1 Secondary and laneway dwellings.

The high value streetscapes of the South Paddington Conservation Area rely on a certain degree of uniformity of the buildings that together compose the street wall. While this was achieved historically, modern interventions often fail, especially as seen in secondary dwellings.

Secondary dwellings can vary significantly in form and materials, detracting from rear streetscapes. Controls need to be tightened. There could be a case here for the occasional 'design excellence' solution, including flat planted roofs, but more uniformity than currently exists is required. Here, an envelope control which set max eaves and ridge heights and roof pitch, and rhythm of openings, would assist.

Privacy and overshadowing to neighbours are also issues.

We recommend that Council undertake an urban design study to determine this envelope(s).

As well, Add/amend:

- (6) wall materials are to match walls of the primary house, and windows are to be timber framed. Windows are to be vertically proportioned and are to match the predominant opening rhythm in the row.
- (7) are not to include balconies or decks.
- (8) windows closer than 6m to neighbours' windows must have privacy devices as cited in Clause 4.1.3.6.
- (8) access to the first floor is to be provided internally

Clause 4.1.8.1 (1) Balconies, verandahs and decks.

Maintaining residential amenity should be a key consideration. Increasingly privacy, both aural and visual is being eroded. Overlooking in particular needs to be avoided. It should not be viewed as an unavoidable part of medium density living.

Add:

- (d) Juliet balconies allowed at rear as long as the balustrade does not protrude beyond the external wall face.
- (e) trafficable roofs are not allowed unless it can be demonstrated that overlooking of private open spaces and living areas is completely avoided

<u>Clause 4.1.9. Car Parking.</u> Roller shutters for rear car access are degrading many streetscapes in South Paddington. This applies especially to streets where terraces face the rears of terraces opposite, such as in Alexander St, Leinster St, Walter Lane, Iris St.

Add:

(6) Where car access is proposed to rear open spaces in a street which has the primary address of houses opposite, sliding gates or vertical lift panel doors are preferred with high quality cladding such as zinc, anodised aluminium, timber. Roller shutter drums are not to be exposed to view from the street.

3 MISSING DCP CONTROLS

<u>Work Affecting Party Walls.</u> Party walls of terrace houses can be poorly impacted by development, e.g. by the demolition of bracing cross-walls, affecting neighbours. Despite DA forms requiring the consent of owners of party walls, applications are frequently accepted and determined without the consent of adjoining neighbours, potentially leading to disputes and damages.

A comparative study of Bayside Council and Inner West Council's Party Wall Consent forms, and Woollahra DCP controls (last item) suggests the following:

- An application which proposes work on a party wall or works which rely on a party wall for lateral or vertical support must be accompanied by the written consent of all owners of the party wall.
- If the works are supported independently of the party wall the application must be accompanied by a certificate from a qualified structural engineer that the design is independently supported and does not rely on the party wall for lateral or vertical support.
- New openings in internal walls and floors lateral to party walls must retain the structural integrity of the building and its neighbours, and should retain the significant original ceilings and cornices. Interpretation of original wall positions and room proportions of the principal building form should be provided.

<u>Retention of masonry walling above new glazed openings</u>. Terrace houses are traditionally load-bearing masonry structures with small openings for windows and doors. Good conservation practice is to retain as much of the original fabric as possible.

Many alterations to existing masonry fabric involve inserting extensive new glazed openings on the ground floor so that the existing masonry above must be partly or wholly demolished to insert beams above the openings, to support the masonry. Heritage fabric (original bricks) should be salvaged and re-used above the new glazing.

Add

- If the work involves demolition of original bricks walls in lime mortar e.g. above new glazed openings, the walls are to be re-built using the original bricks. Light-weight walls in lieu are not acceptable.

<u>Excavation and Pools</u>. The application to install basements and pools is becoming more common, and can impact on neighbouring properties on Paddington's narrow lots. These recommended controls have been extracted from Woollahra Council's Paddington DCP.

- Excavation will not be permitted under common walls or under footings to common walls, or under the front main building (note this avoids the removal of existing timber flooring to these rooms), or where groundwater flows are affected.
- All buildings that do not have damp proof courses within their party walls must have a timber floor at their lowest floor level (note this reduces damp problems for party walls This should be a standard condition of any consent granted for these kinds of works.)
- Ground levels of alterations and additions and infill development are to be consistent with levels established by existing buildings and topography on adjoining sites.
- Excavation for pools and spas is permitted if the outer edge of excavation is setback from side boundaries by at least 900mm
- Pools are to be located at the rear of properties and must not have an adverse impact on the fabric or amenity (noise from equipment, lighting, backwash discharge) of adjoining properties

Yours faithfully

Will Mrongovius,

President, The Paddington Society

Ph: 0407 418 780 email: wmrongovius@gmail.com

Per Linda Gosling, Committee Member

PHOTOS



In 2017 and 2020 DAs were approved for major additions and alterations to 18 and 20 Bent St But Council did not condition the removal of the detracting front fences



Ill-proportioned front dormers at 1 Martin St and rear of 6 Walter St (secondary dwelling), one too tall and one too wide
The left hand dormer has unnecessary downpipes to each side.



These front dormers in Bent St show too much variation in window styles, and the roof overhangs are uncomfortably large



Rear of Renny St terraces from Renny Lane. Over the years a wide variety of form and glazing patterns to Rear Roof Extensions have been approved, destroying the cohesion of the row.

Clear glazing of these Extensions does not meet privacy controls.

Rear building alignments have also not been respected



Another example of uncontrolled rear roof extensions at rear of Walter St terraces, visual clutter when viewed from Martin St and from surrounding houses.

Full height glazing and embedded balconies impact on neighbors' privacy.



Despite the intact row of 7 terraces at 3-15 Church St, a Rear Roof Extension was approved at 7 Church St, setting a precedent. The downpipe design is not well resolved. This roof is clearly viewed from Church Place and from surrounding houses.



Almost full-width Rear roof extensions for No 13 and 15 Martin St, & then 11 Martin St (now built) were approved, due to the small lot size:

but the result is a 3 storey terrace row that overlooks and dominates the 2-storey terraces in Walter St

Source: Council report for 11 Martin St DA in 2017



The west side of Iris St consists almost entirely of secondary dwellings to the rear of terraces in Selwyn St.

The wide variety of styles, materials, fenestration, access, eaves height etc results in a chaotic streetscape wall facing the terraces opposite.



The south side of Josephson St has many garages and secondary dwellings to the rears of the grand heritage item terraces in Moore Park Rd which face Josephson St terraces. Stricter envelope, openings and materials controls would ensure a better streetscape.



Similarly, the terraces in Alexander St face the uncontrolled rears of large terraces in Oatley Rd. Roller shutter controls and allowing only traditional rear dormers in this situation would assist